

Asiatische Studien
Études Asiatiques
LXVI · 2 · 2012

Zeitschrift der Schweizerischen Asiengesellschaft
Revue de la Société Suisse – Asie



Peter Lang

Bern · Berlin · Bruxelles · Frankfurt am Main · New York · Oxford · Wien

ISSN 0004-4717

© Peter Lang AG, Internationaler Verlag der Wissenschaften, Bern 2012
Hochfeldstrasse 32, CH-3012 Bern, Schweiz
info@peterlang.com, www.peterlang.com

Alle Rechte vorbehalten.

Das Werk einschließlich aller seiner Teile ist urheberrechtlich geschützt.
Jede Verwertung außerhalb der engen Grenzen des Urheberrechtsgesetzes
ist ohne Zustimmung des Verlages unzulässig und strafbar. Das gilt
insbesondere für Vervielfältigungen, Übersetzungen, Mikroverfilmungen und
die Einspeicherung und Verarbeitung in elektronischen Systemen.

Printed in Hungary

INHALTSVERZEICHNIS – TABLE DES MATIÈRES CONTENTS

Aufsätze – Articles – Articles

JOHANNES BRONKHORST	227
Levels of Cognition: Did Indian philosophers know something we do not?	

NADIA CATTONI	239
Le commentaire littéraire: entre classification et interprétation. Exemples issus de la <i>Śṛṅgāradīpikā</i> et de la <i>Bhāvadīpikā</i> de Vemabhūpāla	

BOGDAN DIACONESCU	261
On the New Ways of the Late Vedic Hermeneutics: Mīmāṃsā and Navya-Nyāya	

DANIELLE FELLER	307
Viṣṇu, Śiva, and Kālidāsa: References to the divinities in the <i>Meghadūta</i>	

PAUL KIPARSKY	327
Pāṇini, Variation, and Orthoepic Diaskeuasis	

ELSA LEGITTIMO	337
<i>Buddhānusmṛti</i> between Worship and Meditation: Early currents of the Chinese <i>Ekottarika-āgama</i>	

Rezensionsaufsatz – Compte rendu – Review article

ALBRECHT WEZLER	403
‘Wiedervereinigung’ der russischen und westlichen Indologie?	

Bericht – Rapport – Report

JOHANNES BRONKHORST	453
Publications received by the regional editor (from Jan 2010 to Dec 2011)	

Rezensionen – Comptes rendus – Reviews

AKṢAPĀDA PAKṢILASVĀMIN / GAUTAMA AKṢAPĀDA	479
<i>L'art de conduire la pensée en Inde Ancienne. Nyāya-Sūtra de Gautama</i>	
<i>Akṣapāda et Nyāya-Bhāṣya d'Akṣapāda Pakṣilasvāmin.</i>	
Édition, traduction et présentation de Michel ANGOT.	
(Elisa Freschi)	
FRIEDERIKE ASSANDRI	488
<i>Beyond the Daode jing: Twofold Mystery in Tang Daoism.</i>	
(Dominic Steavu)	
CARMEN MEINERT (ED.)	495
<i>Traces of Humanism in China: Tradition and Modernity.</i>	
(John Makeham)	
THOMAS JÜLCH	498
<i>Der Orden des Sima Chengzhen und des Wang Ziqiao. Untersuchungen</i>	
<i>zur Geschichte des Shangqing-Daoismus in den Tiantai-Bergen.</i>	
(Friederike Assandri)	
SHADI OLIAEI	504
<i>L'art du conteur dans les cafés traditionnels en Iran.</i>	
(Katayun Amirpur)	
FABIAN SCHÄFER (HG.)	508
<i>Tosaka Jun – Ideologie, Medien, Alltag. Eine Auswahl ideologiekritischer,</i>	
<i>kultur- und medientheoretischer und geschichtsphilosophischer Schriften.</i>	
(Elena Louisa Lange)	
Autoren – Auteurs – Authors	515

concludes that there has never been a fixed meaning of “humanism” in modern Chinese texts.

As is typical of many edited volumes, the whole is something less than the sum of its parts. The retrospective interrogation of various periods and events in Chinese history through the interpretative lens of the elusive and opaque concept “humanism” – over which the concept’s European origins continue to cast a shadow, despite the claims made in the volume’s Foreword (and cited above) – is a curious experiment, but one that left me wondering just what value and meaning should be attached to the traces that the editor believes have been revealed in the volume.

John Makeham

JÜLCH, Thomas: *Der Orden des Sima Chengzhen und des Wang Ziqiao. Untersuchungen zur Geschichte des Shangqing-Daoismus in den Tiantai-Bergen*. München: Herbert Utz Verlag, 2011 (Sprach und Literaturwissenschaften Band 39). 154 pp., ISBN 978-3-8316-4083-6.

This book, written in German, presents annotated translations of two Chinese texts from the 8th and 9th centuries CE, which relate to the history of Daoism in the Tiantai Mountains in Zhejiang: the *Shangqing shidi chen Tongbo Zhenren zhen tuzan* 上清侍帝晨桐柏真人真圖讚 (Veritable Illustrations with Eulogies of the Imperial Chamberlain of Shangqing and Zhenren of [Mount] Tongbo¹), DZ 621, by Sima Chengzhen 司馬承禎 (647–735) and the *Tiantaishan ji* 天台山記 (Record of Mount Tiantai) by Xu Lingfu 徐靈府 (827–876²). In addition, a short chapter summarizes the most important texts contained in the *Tiantai shan zhi* 天台山志 (Monograph on Mount Tiantai, DZ 603), a compilation dated to 1367 (ROBSON, 2002: 25) or 1368 (ALLISTONE, 2004: 913) (not 1637 as stated on p. 89 in a rather unfortunate typing error), which also contains materials on the history of Daoism in the Tiantai Mountains.

The author explains in a short preface that the two translations were originally two separate essays, which were compiled together with materials on the third text in this book. In fact, rather than creating a coherent narrative, the book presents its textual sources separately. Each text is preceded by a short introduc-

1 The English translation of the title follows VERELLEN, 2004: 424.

2 Date provided by BUJARD, 2000: 145.

tion, where Jülch provides contextual information and presents also his analytical conclusions, which focus on the possible political motives and the strategies of justification of “the relocation of the center of the Shangqing school from Mount Mao to Mount Tongbo [in the Tiantai mountains]” (p.1) by Sima Chengzhen. The translation of Sima Chengzhen’s text is accompanied by 10 pages with reproductions of the illustrations of the original edition of the text in the Daoist Canon. Copies of the original Chinese texts of the *Shangqing shidi chen Tongbo Zhenren zhen tuzan* from the *Daozang*, including its illustrations, and of the *Tiantai shan ji* from the *Tangwen shiyi* 唐文拾遺 edition are appended at the end of the book. The book is completed by a bibliography, but does not have an index.

The introduction portrays Sima Chengzen, the Shangqing school (here we find the three highest heavens of Daoism listed in reverse order³), and Jülch’s main thesis that Sima Chengzhen constructed an ideology around Wang Ziqiao and himself to justify a “relocation” of the Shangqing school from Mount Mao to Mount Tiantai, which was requested by the imperial court.

The first text translated, the *Shangqing shidi chen Tongbo Zhenren zhen tuzan*, is an illustrated hagiography of the ancient immortal Wang Ziqiao 王子喬. Jülch’s introduction to the translation summarizes two main traditions of the earlier Wang Ziqiao hagiography and explains Sima Chengzhen’s contribution to the development of this hagiographical tradition. It then offers in a section entitled “Buddhist Influence” (pp. 12–14) an interesting discussion of parallels between Sima Chengzhen’s development of the vita of the Daoist immortal with the Legend of the Buddha as it was introduced in China in the *Lalitavistara Sūtra* (*Puyao jing* 普曜經, T 186).

The *Shangqing shidi chen Tongbo Zhenren zhen tuzan* presents Wang Ziqiao’s vita in 11 illustrated sections. It combines and reconciles different traditions of the Wang Ziqiao legends, describing first Wang’s “earthly” career, as son of the emperor Ling of the ancient Zhou dynasty (r. 571–545 BCE), who studied Daoism, cultivated himself on Mount Song and eventually alighted riding on a crane to become an immortal. From there the story proceeds to pre-

3 Jülch refers here to Kohn’s entry in the *Encyclopedia of Daoism on the Three Clarities* (*sanqing*) (KOHN, 2008: 840–844), which lists *yuqing*, *shangqing* *taiqing* in (implicit) descending order. Adding the qualifiers “unterhalb” (below) and “oberhalb” (above), he reverses the order, naming *yuqing* as the lowest of the three heavens. However, during most of early medieval China, including the Tang dynasty, the *yuqing* heaven was regarded as the highest of the Three Clarities. Compare BOKENKAMP, 1997: 190.

sent his “heavenly” career, which establishes his relation to Mount Tongbo in the Tiantai Mountains, where he is installed by Dadaojun 大道君, the Great Lord of Dao, as ruler over the “Golden Court Grotto Heaven of Reverence of the Wondrous” (金庭崇妙洞天). It is in this role, and with the insignia of this position, that Wang Ziqiao finally descends, together with other immortals, to reveal scriptures to Yang Xi (330–386), the original recipient of the Shangqing scriptures.

Sima Chengzhen’s preface to the hagiography clearly draws parallels between Wang Ziqiao and Sima himself; most prominently the fact that also Sima Chengzhen studied on Mount Song, and then relocated to Mount Tongbo.

The second text translated is a topographical essay on the Tiantai mountains, written by Xu Lingfu, a Tang Dynasty Daoist, who came from Nanyue, the southern marchmount, and settled in the Tiantai mountains. Xu Lingfu was a student of Tian Xuying 田虛應, who in turn was a disciple of Xue Jichang 薛季昌. This lineage, which names Xue Jichang as the successor of Sima Chengzhen differs from the common Shangqing lineage description, which recognizes Li Hanguang as Sima Chengzhen’s successor. This documents that in Tang dynasty there must have existed at least two different traditions of Shangqing lineages.⁴

The *Tiantai shan ji* (p. 72 f.) records that the Tang emperor Ruizong 睿宗 (r. 684–690) ordered Sima Chengzhen to renovate the old Tongbo temple 桐柏觀, said to have been the residence of the eminent Daoist saint Ge Xuan 葛玄 (3rd century CE), and to settle there. It is this detail that leads Jülch to suspect that Sima Chengzhen “relocated the center of the Shangqing school into the Tiantai mountains” (p. 52) for ultimately political reasons, even though the text also emphasizes that Sima Chengzhen did not actively seek the contact with the court. We also find further evidence for the association of Sima Chengzhen with Wang Ziqiao.

The *Tiantai shan ji* embeds in its topographical description numerous references not only to Daoists who formerly were active on Mount Tiantai, but also to Buddhists. Interestingly, the text, even if written by a well known Daoist, is not preserved in the Daoist Canon, but in the Buddhist Canon (T 2096), in addition to the edition in the *Tangwen shiyi*, on which Jülch based his trans-

4 This lineage description is found in the *Dongxuan lingbao sanshi ji* 洞玄靈寶三師記 (Record of the Three Masters of the Dongxuan Lingbao tradition) DZ 444, attributed to Liu Chujing 劉處靜, and has a foreword dated to 920 CE (LAGERWEY, 2004: 417–418).

lation. Jülch notes, that the Buddhists in general, and the famous Master Tiantai Zhiyi 智顗 (538–597 CE) in particular, are depicted in a positive light; a circumstance which is confirmed also by the fact that Sima Chengzhen's writings show influence of the ideas of the Buddhist Tiantai Zhiyi (p. 54).

The last text regarding the history of Daoism on Mount Tiantai, the *Tiantai shan zhi*, is presented only summarily, with a listing of the different texts contained in the compilation, short summaries of most of them, including some bibliographical references for further studies, and translations of four short excerpts which document citations from the *Tiantai shan ji*. Jülch speaks here of a "Textspektrum" (p. 93), comprising apart from the texts translated and discussed also older texts, namely Tao Hongjing's 陶弘景 *Zhengao* 真誥 (DZ 1016) and *Deng zhen yinjue* 登真隱訣 (DZ 421), and Sun Chuo's 孫綽 *You Tiantai shan fu* 遊天台山賦 (*Wenxuan* 文選, j.11).

The author is to be commended for having brought together very different categories of texts, a hagiography, a topography, and a local chronicle, which relate in different ways the Daoist Shangqing tradition with the Tiantai Mountains. This is of interest for two reasons. First, Mount Tiantai is most frequently associated not with Daoism but with Buddhism, namely with the Buddhist Tiantai School, founded by Zhi Yi, and second, the Daoist Shangqing tradition is most often associated with Mount Mao, but not with Mount Tiantai.

Mount Mao in Jiangsu had been associated closely with the Daoist Shangqing tradition at least since the famous Master Tao Hongjing 陶弘景 (456–536) settled there in 492 and collected and studied the original Shangqing Manuscripts, which had been dispersed in the area. Tao Hongjing came to be considered the Ninth Patriarch of the Daoist Shangqing tradition. His successor, Wang Yuanzhi 王遠知 (528–653) also resided on Mount Mao. However, Pan Shizheng 潘師正 (585–682), the 11th Patriarch, who had met Wang Yuanzhi at the court of the Sui emperor,⁵ spent hardly any time on Mount Mao. His Master Wang Yuanzhi preferred to send him to the north, and he settled on Mount Song, near Luoyang. Sima Chengzhen, who succeeded Pan Shizheng as 12th Patriarch of the Shangqing school, studied with him on Mount Song and then settled first on Mount Tiantai, and later on Mount Wangwu, in Henan. Only Sima Cheng-

5 Compare Zhao Daoyi 趙道一: *Lishi zhenxian tidao tongjian* 歷世真僊體道通鑑 (Comprehensive Mirror of Immortals who embodied the Dao through the Ages) DZ 296, j. 25.

zhen's successor Li Hanguang 李含光 (683–769) returned to live on Mount Mao in 730⁶.

Considering the fact that not only Sima Chengzhen, but also the 11th Patriarch Pan Shizheng is not associated with Mount Mao⁷, the author's conception of a "relocation of the Shangqing school from Mount Mao to Mount Tiantai"⁸ might need some revisiting. This does not detract from his argument that Sima Chengzhen established his seat in the Tiantai mountain range on Mount Tongbo following an imperial order and possibly with political motivations. It does point however, in this reviewer's opinion, to the fact that we might get closer to understanding early medieval and Tang dynasty Daoism – and Buddhism for that matter – if we think less in terms of schools, as defined entities located in a specific place, and more in terms of charismatic Masters⁹.

As Robert Sharf has pointed out "the association between a particular monastery and a specific lineage or school [in Buddhism]" was formally authorized by the government only in the Northern Song period (SHARF, 2002: 9). Sharf proposes that "even the fundamental distinctions between Taoism, Confucianism, and Buddhism need to be reconsidered: none of these traditions correspond to the self-contained religious and philosophical systems described in many textbook accounts" (SHARF, 2002: 9). The "Buddhist influence," which Jülch detects in his texts, as well as the open admiration expressed for Tiantai Zhiyi by the Daoist Masters who authored the texts translated here, underscore this latter point.

The texts translated in this book, similar to studies of sacred Mountains in China (e.g. ROBSON, 1995, 2002, 2009, and HARGETT, 2006), undermine cherished, but questionable "definitions" like the one that associates Mount Tiantai only with the Buddhist Tiantai school, or the one that identifies the

6 KIRKLAND, 2008: 637.

7 ROBSON, 2008: 735, points out that using the term "Maoshan Taoism" to designate the Shangqing school is a misnomer because much of the history of this school took place away from Maoshan.

8 "Sima Chengzhen verlegte das Zentrum der [Shangqing] Schule vom Mao-berg auf den Tong-bo-berg [...]" (p. 1); "zur Begründung der Verlegung des Zentrums der Shangqing Schule schuf Sima Chengzhen eine Ideologie [...]" (p. 2); "die Verlegung des Hauptsitzes der Shangqing-Schule in die Tiantai-Berge [...]" (p. 51).

9 In this sense also Sima Chengzhen's particular interest in the figure of Wang Ziqiao, as well as the emphasis on the affinity of Sima Chengzhen and Wang Ziqiao in the *Tiantai shan ji*, which Jülch interprets as part of a strategy for the ideological justification of the relocation of the main seat of the Shangqing school to the Tiantai Mountains (p. 52–53), could be read as a strategy to raise Sima Chengzhen's personal status and imbue him with an aura of myth.

Shangqing tradition as “Maoshan school,” and serve to open our eyes to the fact that in terms of religion, local realities might have been more complex than previously assumed.

The book is of interest to scholars studying the local history of Mount Tiantai as well as to those interested in the interaction of Daoist Masters with the imperial court in Tang dynasty. The texts translated are a must-read for scholars and students researching the historical development and lineages of Shangqing Daoism.

References

ALLISTONE, Denis

2004 “Tiantai shan zhi.” In: Kristofer SCHIPPER / Franciscus VERELLEN (ed.): *The Taoist Canon. A Historical Companion to the Daozang*. Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, p. 913.

BOKENKAMP, Stephen R.

1997 *Early Daoist Scriptures*. Berkley, Los Angeles: University of California Press.

BUJARD, Marianne

2000 “Le culte de Wangzi Qiao ou la longue carrière d’un immortel.” *Études chinoises* 19: 115–158.

HARGETT, James

2006 *Stairway to Heaven*. New York: SUNY.

KIRKLAND, Russel

2008 “Li Hanguang.” In: Fabrizio PREGADIO (ed.): *The Routledge Encyclopedia of Taoism*, 2 vols. Oxon & New York: Routledge, pp. 637–638.

KOHN, Livia

2008 “Sanqing.” In: Fabrizio PREGADIO (ed.): *The Routledge Encyclopedia of Taoism*, 2 vols. Oxon & New York: Routledge, pp. 840–844.

LAGERWEY, John

2004 “Dongxuan Lingbao Sanshi ji.” In: Kristofer SCHIPPER / Franciscus VERELLEN (ed.): *The Taoist Canon. A Historical Companion to the Daozang*. Chicago & London: University of Chicago Press, pp. 417–418.

ROBSON, James

1995 “The Polymorphous Space of the Southern Marchmount [Nanyue].” *Cahiers d’Extrême-Asie*, Vol. 8: 221–264.

- 2002 *Imagining Nanyue: A Religious History of the Southern marchmount through the Tang Dynasty [618–907]*. PhD Diss. Stanford. Ann Arbor: ProQuest, UMI, No. 3067932.
- 2009 *Power of Place*. Cambridge and London: Harvard University Press.
- 2008 “Maoshan.” In: Fabrizio PREGADIO (ed.): *The Routledge Encyclopedia of Taoism*, 2 vols. Oxon & New York: Routledge, pp. 734–736.
- SHARF, Robert
- 2002 *Coming to Terms with Chinese Buddhism. A Reading of the Treasure Store Treatise*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press.
- VERELLEN, Franciscus
- 2004 “Shangqing shi dichen Tongbo Zhenren zhen tuzan,” In: Kristofer SCHIPPER / Franciscus VERELLEN (ed.): *The Taoist Canon. A Historical Companion to the Daozang*. Chicago & London: University of Chicago Press, pp. 424–426.

Friederike Assandri

OLIAEI, Shadi: *L'art du conteur dans les cafés traditionnels en Iran*. Paris: L'Harmattan, 2010. 408 pp., ISBN 978-2-2961-0423-5.

Als wäre es ein ungeschriebenes Gesetz: Alle schönen Traditionen sterben aus. Deshalb können wir froh sein, dass Shadi Oliaei sich diese wunderbare Tradition noch einmal angeschaut hat, kurz bevor sie durch Internet und Fernsehen vollkommen verdrängt wird. Die Rede ist von *naqqali*, der Kaffeehauserzählung. Seit Jahrhunderten wird in Iran in den Kaffeehäusern das Königsbuch des Ferdousi, die *Shahname*, dargeboten. Ein Erzähler, *naqqal*, läßt durch Zitate aus der *Shahname*, aber auch durch eigene Zusammenfassungen und Prosäüberleitungen die einzelnen Sagen und Geschichten vor den Hörern lebendig werden. Außerdem spielt seine Darstellung der handelnden Charaktere eine große Rolle bei dieser Inszenierung, die viel vom iranischen Theater hat, aber mit einem einzigen Darsteller / Erzähler auskommt. Der *naqqal* rezitiert nicht nur die Geschichten aus der *Shahname*; er ist auch Darsteller und Schöpfer. Er schlüpft in die Haut der handelnden Personen, er imitiert, rezitiert, singt und kritisiert. Mit zwei oder drei Worten schafft er eine Welt, eine Person, ein Ereignis. Und mit einer einzigen Geste modifiziert er die Zusammenstellung, um ihr eine neue Richtung zu geben. Wie das genau funktioniert, zeigt Oliaei, indem sie die Vorführtechnik dreier zeitgenössischer Erzähler, die sie zum Teil begleitet hat, beschreibt und